

Male circumcision and HIV prevention: Ethical, Medical and Public Health Tradeoffs in Low-Income Countries.

Stuart Rennie*
Adamson S. Muula**, ***
Daniel Westreich**

*Department of Social Medicine, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27599-7450. Telephone: (919) 9420927. Email: stuart_rennie@unc.edu. Fax: (919) 9666185. **Department of Epidemiology, School of Public Health, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, USA. ***Department of Community Health, University of Malawi, College of Medicine, Blantyre, Malawi.

Abstracts

Researchers have been exploring the possibility of a correlation between male circumcision and lowered risk of HIV infection since nearly the beginning of the epidemic. The results of recent randomized controlled trials in South Africa, Kenya and Uganda indicate that male circumcision offers men an important degree of protection against the acquisition of HIV through heterosexual intercourse, confirming dominant trends from 20 years of observational studies. This article uses age at circumcision as a vantage point to discuss some of the important ethical and public health issues surrounding the potential implementation of male circumcision as part of a comprehensive HIV prevention strategy in high-prevalence, low-income countries. We conclude that this promising but controversial strategy can only be successful if there is an open, honest and continuous dialogue among all stakeholders about the many ethical challenges faced by this novel approach to HIV prevention. (PHD 2006 Vol 13 No 2 Pages 141- 142)

Notes from the Editor

The full text of this article can be accessed from <http://jme.bmj.com/preprint/rennie.pdf>

References

- 1 Fink AJ. A possible explanation for heterosexual male infection with AIDS. *NEJM*. 1986;315: 1167.
- 2 Auvert B, Taljaard D, Lagarde E, et. al. Randomized controlled intervention trial of male circumcision for reduction of HIV infection risk: the ANRS 1265 trial. *PLoS Med*. 2005;12: 298.
- 3 Siegfried N, Muller M, Volmink J, et. al. Male circumcision for prevention of heterosexual acquisition of HIV in men. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*. 2003; 3. Art. No.:CD003362.
- 4 Williams BG, Lloyd-Smith JO, Gouws E, et. al. The Potential Impact of Male Circumcision on HIV in Sub-Saharan Africa. *PLoS Med*. 2006; 3(7): e262.
- 5 National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Disease. Adult male circumcision significantly reduces risk

of acquiring HIV: trials Kenya and Uganda stopped early. Pressrelease. http://www3.niaid.nih.gov/news/newsreleases/2006/AMC12_06.htm

- 6 Nolen S. Male circumcision not an easy answer for HIV. *Globe and Mail* (Toronto).2006;August 16.
- 7 Ntozi, JMP. Using circumcision to prevent HIV infection: the view of an African. *Health Transit Rev*. 1997; 7 (supp.): 97-100.
8. Siegfried, N. Does male circumcision prevent HIV transmission? *PLoS Med*.2005;2(11): e393.
- 9 Benatar M, Benatar D. Between prophylaxis and child abuse: the ethics of neonatal male circumcision. *Am J Bioeth*. 2003;3(2): 35-48.
- 10 Fox M, Thomson M. A covenant with the status quo? Male circumcision and the new BMA guidance to doctors. *J Med Ethics*. 2005;31: 463-469.
- 11 Hellsten SK. Rationalizing circumcision: from tradition to fashion, from public health to individual freedom – critical notes on cultural persistence of the practice of genital mutilation. *J Med Ethics*. 2004;30:248-253.
- 12 Gollaher DL. *Circumcision: a history of the world's most controversial surgery*. New York: Basic Books 2000.

Researchers have been exploring the possibility of a correlation between male circumcision and lowered risk of HIV infection since nearly the beginning of the epidemic

REPRINT

- 13 Darby R. *A surgical temptation: the demonization of the foreskin and the rise of circumcision in Britain*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press 2005.
- 14 Remondino PC. *History of circumcision from the earliest times to the present: Moral and physical reasons for its performance*. Philadelphia and London: F.A. Davis 1891.
- 15 Hutchinson J. On Circumcision as Preventive of Masturbation. *Arch Surg*. 1891;2:267-268.
- 16 Allen J (1909) Bilharzia haematobia and circumcision. *Lancet*. 1909;173(4471):1317-20.
- 17 Schoen EJ, Oehrli M, Colby CJ, Machin G. The highly protective effect of newborn circumcision against invasive penile cancer. *Pediatrics*. 2000;105(3): e36-e39.
- 18 Cook LS, Koutsky LA, Holmes KK. Circumcision and sexually transmitted diseases. *AJPH*. 1994; 84: 197-201.
- 19 To T, Aghar M, Dick PT, et. al. Cohort study on circumcision on newborn boys and subsequent risk of urinary tract infection. *Lancet*. 1998;352: 1813-16.
- 20 Castellsague X, Bosch FX, Munoz N, et. al. Male circumcision, penile human papillomavirus infection, and cervical cancer in female partners. *N Engl J Med* 2002;346(15) :1105-12.
- 21 Cutler SJ, Young JL Jr. *Third national cancer survey: incidence data*. Bethesda, Md. US Dept of Health, Education, and Welfare, Public Health Service 1975.
- 22 Drain PK, Halperin DT, Hughes JP et. al. Male circumcision, religion, and infectious diseases: An ecologic analysis of 118 developing countries. *BMC Infect Dis*. 2006;6(1):172.
- 23 Castellsague X, Peeling RW, Franceschi S, et. al. Chlamydia trachomatis infection in female partners of circumcised and uncircumcised adult men. *Am J Epidemiol*. 2005;162(9):907-16.
- 24 Laumann EO, Masi CM, Zuckerman EW. Circumcision in the United States: prevalence, prophylactic effects and sexual practice. *JAMA*. 1997;277: 1052-57.
- 25 Wise, J. Demand for male circumcision rises in a bid to prevent HIV. *Bull World Health Organ*. 2006; 84(7): 509-511.
- 26 Kelly R et. al. Age of circumcision and risk of prevalent HIV infection in rural Uganda. *AIDS*. 1999; 13 (3): 399-405.
- 27 Cassell M, Halperin D, Shelton J, et. al. Risk compensation: the Achilles' heel of innovations in HIV prevention? *BMJ*. 2006;332: 605-607.
- 28 Richens J, Imrie J, Copas A. Condoms and seat belts: the parallels and lessons. *Lancet*. 2000;355: 400-3.
- 29 *Schoendorff v New York Hospital* (211 NY, 105 NE 92, 93). 1914.
- 30 Pettifor A, Kleinschmidt I, Levin J, et. al. Young people's sexual health in South Africa: HIV prevalence and sexual behaviors from a nationally representative household survey. *AIDS* 2005; Sep 23;19(14):1525-34.
- 31 Kebaabetswe P, Lockman S, Mogwe S, et. al. Male circumcision: an acceptable strategy for HIV prevention in Botswana. *Sex Transm Infect*. 2003;79: 214-219.
- 32 Grant E, Brown J, Michen K, et. al. 'Seizing the day': right time, right place and right message for adolescent reproductive sexual health. Lessons from the Meru of Eastern province Kenya. *International Journal of Men's Health*. 2004;3 (3):189-196.
- 33 Marck J. Aspects of male circumcision in sub-equatorial African culture history. *Health Transit Rev*. 1997; 7 (Suppl): 337-359.
- 34 Muula AS, Mfutso-Bengo JM. Important but neglected ethical and cultural considerations in the fight against HIV/AIDS in Malawi. *Nurs Ethics*. 2004;11 (5): 479-488.
- 35 Ahlberg BM. The Mwomboko Research Project: the practice of male circumcision in central Kenya and its implications for the transmission and prevention of STD/HIV. *African Sociological Review*. 1997; 1 (1) 66-81.
- 36 Green EC. Male circumcision and HIV infection. *Lancet*. 2000;355 (9207): 927.
- 37 Harrison R. Circumcision makes comeback in AIDS-hit Swaziland. *Reuters*. 2006; February 24; Timberg C. In Swaziland, science revives an old rite; circumcision makes a comeback to fight AIDS. *Washington Post*. 2005; December 26.
- 38 United Nations Economic and Social Council. The Siracusa Principles on the limitations and derogation provisions in the international covenant on civil and political rights. *UN Doc. E/CN.4/1985/4*. 1985; Annex.

We conclude that this promising but controversial strategy can only be successful if there is an open, honest and continuous dialogue among all stakeholders about the many ethical challenges faced by this novel approach to HIV prevention